

ALTERNATIVE DEVELOPMENT

SA64A-MODULE 3: WEEK 5

Henry-Lee/Northover

1

ALTERNATIVE DEVELOPMENT

- A minimalist morally realist manifesto of what “development should be”.
- “Alternative development is a cry for visibility, participation and justice” B. Hettne (1995) *Development Theory and the Three Worlds*.
- “Justice thus involves equality of consideration, in which *basic needs* are trumps, whoever’s they may be” R. Attfield and B. Wilkins, (1992) *International Justice and the Third World*, p. 5 quoted in in A. Dickson “Development and International Relations”

Henry-Lee/Northover

2

CAME ABOUT BECAUSE:

- 1. Growth of NGOs
- 2. Increasing importance of environmental concerns and sustainability gave rise to ecological economies
- 3. Glaring failures of the several development decades and the rise of the basic needs paradigm as an alternative to the development = growth view

Henry-Lee/Northover

3

CAME ABOUT BECAUSE

- 4. Political economy challenges from Bretton Woods institutions. Bretton Woods (1944) which saw 44 countries negotiating a new economic order and the establishment of the IMF and the International Bank for the Reconstruction and Development

Henry-Lee/Northover

4

TWO KEY CHARACTERISTICS

- Redefinition of development goals: the move away from a utilitarian view of wellbeing supporting a focus on income/growth and a shift to a human rights based approach to wellbeing which supports a focus on needs/capabilities/freedoms.
- Shift of attention to civil society and organizations ‘outside of’ the formal political system and corporate economy.

Henry-Lee/Northover

5

Amartya Sen and the redefinition of development goals

- DEVELOPMENT AS FREEDOM-
- Sen’s research has highlighted the idea that in the final analysis, market outcomes and government action should be judged in terms of *valuable human ends* (ODI Briefing Paper, November 2001)
- .

Henry-Lee/Northover

6

Sen

- “Development can be seen...as a process of expanding the real freedoms that people enjoy” Sen (1999 p. 3) This is the motif for the Human Development reports.
- Development requires the removal of major sources of unfreedom: Poverty as well as tyranny, poor economic opportunities as well as systematic social deprivation, neglect of public facilities as well as intolerance or over activity of repressive states” Sen (1999 p. 3)

Henry-Lee/Northover

7

Basic Concepts (Sen)

- Functioning: the things that a person may value *doing or being* (ranges from being adequately nourished to complex activities e.g. participating and appearing without shame)
- Capability – *ability of a person to achieve* different combinations of functioning – the opportunity or freedom to choose the life that one values- close to Weber’s theory of life chances

Henry-Lee/Northover

8

Sen

- “Lack of substantive freedoms [sometimes relates directly to economic poverty] which robs people of the freedom to satisfy hunger to achieve sufficient nutrition or to obtain remedies for treatable illnesses or the opportunity to be adequately clothed or sheltered or to enjoy clean water or sanitary facilities” (1999,4)

Henry-Lee/Northover

9

Sen

Five distinct types of freedom (Joint importance):

- Political freedom (premise democratic states)
 - Economic facilities
 - Social opportunities
 - Transparency guarantees
 - Protective Security
- “Each of these distinct types of rights and opportunities helps to advance the general capability of a person” Sen (1999, p10).

Henry-Lee/Northover

10

DEVELOPMENT AS FREEDOM-

- This has led to a focus on the *quality of life of individuals* in development evaluations and has supported, for example, the shift to alternative development indicators, such as the HDI
- It has also led to the focus on the individual being the *agent for his/her own development through participating in policy decision making processes.*

Henry-Lee/Northover

11

DEVELOPMENT AS FREEDOM-

I

- Finally, this paradigm has led to a concern for the institutional mechanisms that enhance (or suppress) peoples' range of choices. For example mechanisms such as the forms of discrimination in labor markets, in access to land or public policy on provisioning of social goods, e.g. health education.

Henry-Lee/Northover

12

Sen

- His research has shown that economic growth and income can be poor predictors of the *capability to live* to a mature age without succumbing to premature mortality.
- *Most cases of starvation and famines across the world arise not from people being deprived of things to which they are entitled, but from people not being entitled in the prevailing legal system of institutional rights to adequate means of survival.*
Source: ODI Briefing November 2001p.2)

The Right to Development

- The Declaration on the “Right to Development (adopted by the UN Assembly in December 1986)” states that:

"the right to development..."

- ...is an inalienable human right by virtue of which every human person and all peoples are entitled to participate in, contribute to, and enjoy economic, social, cultural and political development, in which all human rights and fundamental freedoms can be fully realized."

(<http://www.unhchr.ch/development/right.html>)

The right includes:

- Full sovereignty over natural resources
- Self-determination
- Popular participation in development
- Equality of opportunity
- The creation of favourable conditions for the enjoyment of other civil, political, economic, social and Cultural Rights

(<http://www.unhchr.ch/development/right-01.html#develop>)

Human Rights:Article 25 (1)

Everybody has the right to a standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of himself and of his family, including food, clothing, housing and medical care and necessary social services and the right to security in the event of unemployment, sickness, disability, widowhood, old age or other lack of livelihood in circumstances beyond his control.

<http://www.hst.org.za/sahr/99/chap1.htm>

The Evolution of Development indicators

- HDI- (UNDP) captures 3 critical capabilities (achieving knowledge, longevity and a decent standard of living)
- Gender Related Development Index captures the gender based inequalities in the achievement of these capabilities

Poverty

- Poverty is the most common and serious violation of human rights (South Africa Health 1999p.2)

Henry-Lee/Northover

19

Freedom of choice and action

- *“The Rich is the one who says: I am going to do it and does it. The poor in contrast do not fulfill their wishes or develop their capacities.”* A Poor woman in Brazil.
- *Poverty is “like living in jail, under bondage, waiting to be free* (A young woman in Jamaica). (World Bank- Voices of the Poor)

Henry-Lee/Northover

20

Poverty Indicators

- Human Poverty Index- captures deprivation: standard of living characterized in terms of access to safe water, health services and birth-weight
- Gender Empowerment Measure- focuses on women's opportunities rather than their capabilities (e.g. political participation, economic participation (professional and technical positions, earned income))

Henry-Lee/Northover

21

Indicators, contd.

- World Bank- speaks of poverty as vulnerability, lack of voice, power and representation
- **Gender-Equity-Sensitive Indicator X_{ede}**
- Equality versus equity

Henry-Lee/Northover

22

Social development

- Social development
- <http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/essd/essd.nsf/SocialDevelopment/HOME>
- Social development is development that is equitable, socially inclusive and therefore sustainable.
- It promotes local, national and global institutions that are responsive accountable and inclusive and it empowers poor and vulnerable people to participate effectively in development processes.
- The Social Development group is in the Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development (ESSD) network of the World Bank.

Henry-Lee/Northover

23

Chapter 3 of Agenda 21, & commitment 2 of the Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development.

- Priority actions (UN): (1) improving access to sustainable livelihoods, entrepreneurial opportunities and productive resources; (2) providing universal access to basic social services; (3) progressively developing social protection systems to support those who cannot support themselves; (4) empowering people living in poverty and their organizations;

Henry-Lee/Northover

24

Indicators of SOCIAL Development

- Beyond the commonly used economic indicators of well-being, however, social, environmental and institutional indicators have to be taken into account as well to arrive at a broader, more complete picture of societal development: 134 indicators
- <http://www.un.org/esa/sustdev/natlinfo/indicators/isd.htm>

Henry-Lee/Northover

25

Priority Action Areas(UN)

- (5) addressing the disproportionate impact of poverty on women; (6) working with interested donors and recipients to allocate increased shares of ODA to poverty eradication; and (7) intensifying international cooperation for poverty eradication.- Poverty Related

Henry-Lee/Northover

26

Social Exclusion is

- A chronic scarcity of opportunities and access to basic and quality services, labor markets and credit, physical conditions and adequate infrastructure, and the judicial system.

http://198.186.239.120/sds/SOC/site_3094_e.htm

Henry-Lee/Northover

27

Social Exclusion

- This isn't simply a matter of people not being able to **access** material goods, it is also about the nature of **the social relationships** they can engage in.

Henry-Lee/Northover

28

Participation

“Very rudimentary levels of participation between agency staff and community members”

- Welbourne (1991): “equal inclusion of all sections of a typical stratified community: women, men, older, younger, better off and worse-off” in consultations.

Henry-Lee/Northover

29

Empowerment

- “enabling the poor to analyze their own realities and thus influence development priorities; they would have a greater ability (more confidence and skills) to continue acting in their own interests (Nelson and Wright, 1995).

Henry-Lee/Northover

30

Community

- “Culturally, politically homogenous, participatory local social system” Bryson and Mowbray (1981):

Henry-Lee/Northover

31

Community Resources

- Land, Environment, Population, Housing
- Local Economy, Services, Transport Communications, Power Structures, Culture e.g. Cultural Practices, Education/Skills of the community members, Financial Ability of the community members, Level of social Capital (trust, bond)

Henry-Lee/Northover

32

Advantages of Participatory Methodologies

- Considered superior to “top-down” approaches
- Community members gain empowerment if their degree of participation is significant
- Sense of “ownership” of projects and programmes helps with sustainability.

Henry-Lee/Northover

33

Advantages of Participatory Methodologies

- Policy formulators and implementers learn more about the communities within which they work
- Can improve quality of life of the community members and achieve cost effectiveness

Henry-Lee/Northover

34

Disadvantages of the Participatory Methodologies

- Can be used as a cloak to foster support for top-level policies
- Participation may be limited to the most influential community members and the less influential ones are never heard
- Resistance to change from the top-level policy makers

Henry-Lee/Northover

35

Disadvantages of the Participatory Methodologies

- A successful participatory approach to policy formulation is time-consuming.
- Communities do not remain static and cannot use the same voices of the members for long period of time.

Henry-Lee/Northover

36

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT: An APEX CONCEPT OF ALTERNATIVE DEVELOPMENT?

- Definition of sustainable development (UN, 2001):

"Sustainable development is development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs."

- Sustainable development implies economic and social development plus environmental equity or justice, both within and between generations.

Henry-Lee/Northover

37

Development Models contrasted

- Growth Models and Social Transformation (Alternative Development) compared- See handouts.

Henry-Lee/Northover

38

References

- Economic Theory, Freedom and Human Rights: The work of Amartya Sen, ODI Briefing Paper, November 2001.
- Sen., A.K. (1999) *Development as Freedom*, Oxford OUP.
- Pieterse, Jan Nederveen *My Paradigm or Yours? Alternative Development, Post Development, Reflexive Development in Development and Change* Vol.29 (1998) 343-373.
- Martinussen, John (1997). *State, Society and the Market: A guide to competing theories of development*. London: Zen books.

References

- Chambers, Robert (2000). *Whose Reality Counts. Putting the First Last*. ITDG Publishing, London.
- Hawtin et al (1994). *Community Profiling: Auditing Social Needs*. Open University Press
- Holland J. & Blackburn R. (1998). *Whose Voice. Participatory Research and Policy Change*. Intermediate Technology Publications Ltd. London.
- Giujt I. & Kaul Shah (1999). *The Myth of Community. Gender Issues in Participatory Development*. Intermediate Technology Publications Ltd, London.